

**ReliabilityFirst Reliability Standards Voting Process Initial Category Ballot Results**  
**Planning Resource Adequacy Analysis, Assessment and Documentation (BAL-502-RF-03)**  
**01/18/17 through 02/01/17**

Total Affirmative: 27    Total Negative: 1    Total Abstentions: 0    Total Votes Cast: 28

Total Pool Members: 30

Quorum: 93%

Vote Result: **Pass**

Category	Affirmative	Negative	Abstentions	Pool Members	Votes Cast	Votes Counted	Approval	Result
Category 1	6	1	0	7	7	7	85.71 %	Pass
Category 2	5	0	0	6	5	5	100.00 %	Pass
Category 3	7	0	0	7	7	7	100.00 %	Pass
Category 4	3	0	0	4	3	3	100.00 %	Pass
Category 5	6	0	0	6	6	6	100.00 %	Pass

Category	Vote	Member	Entity
Category 1	Affirmative	James Anderson	Consumers Energy Company
	Negative	Scott Cunningham	Ohio Valley Electric Corporation
	Affirmative	Chris Scanlon	Baltimore Gas and Electric Company
	Affirmative	William J Smith	FirstEnergy Utilities
	Affirmative	Greg Milosek	ITC Transmission
	Affirmative	Brenda Lyn Truhe	PPL Electric Utilities Corporation
Category 2	Affirmative	Joseph A. Smith	Public Service Electric & Gas Company
	Affirmative	Jeff DePriest	DTE Electric
	Affirmative	David Greyerbiehl	Consumers Energy Company
	Affirmative	Ruth Miller	Exelon Generation Company, LLC
	Affirmative	Mark Koziel	FirstEnergy Utilities
	Affirmative	Scott Hoggatt	WEC Energy Group
Category 3	No Vote	Sean Bodikin	Dominion Energy
	Affirmative	John Bee	Commonwealth Edison Company
	Affirmative	Jeff Beattie	Consumers Energy Company
	Affirmative	Theresa Ciancio	FirstEnergy Utilities
	Affirmative	Bob Thomas	Illinois Municipal Electric Agency

	Affirmative	Joe O'Brien	Northern Indiana Public Service Company
	Affirmative	William Watson	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative
	Affirmative	Karla Jara	PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC
Category 4	Affirmative	Terry Bilke	MISO
	Affirmative	Mark Holman	PJM Interconnection
	No Vote	Karl Blasowski	Consumers Energy Company
	Affirmative	Tony Jankowski	WEC Energy Group
Category 5	Affirmative	Karie L. Barczak	DTE Electric
	Affirmative	Douglas G Hohlbaugh	FirstEnergy Utilities
	Affirmative	Jeffrey C. Mueller	Public Service Electric & Gas Company
	Affirmative	Margaret Powell	PECO Energy Company
	Affirmative	Tom Breene	WEC Energy Group
	Affirmative	Julie Hegedus	Consumers Energy Company

## Voter Comments

Voted	Name	Entity
Negative	Scott Cunningham	Ohio Valley Electric Corporation

Comment	Response
<p>See comments from initial posting. (The comments from the initial posting included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Comment 1 - "The standard should be retired as it does not address a reliability need. There are adequate market incentives to fill the planning reserve requirement.)</li> <li>2. Comment 2 - "Even if the PC identifies a gap, there is no requirement in any standard to address the gap. There are market incentives for resource owners to address the planning reserve requirement."</li> <li>3. Comment 3 - Similar to the above question, the PC may document load and resources, but there is no requirement in the standards to address any gaps.</li> <li>4. Comment 4 - Given that these standards must function in a market environment, market incentives should address the requirements. If they do not, we should not be fostering a market-driven system.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Response 1 - It is outside of the Standards Authorization Request (SAR) to determine whether the standards should be retired. During the SAR comment period (conducted 04/01/16 – 05/10/16), all individuals whom provided comments agreed with the scope of the SAR. Furthermore during the "five year review" comment period (conducted 02/29/16 – 03/09/16), all individuals who provided comments indicated the Standard should be re-affirmed.  Also, the BAL-502-RF-03 standards does not require the Planning Coordinator to "fill the planning reserve requirement", rather it establishes common criteria, based on "one day in ten year" loss of Load expectation principles, for the analysis, assessment and documentation of Resource Adequacy for Load in the ReliabilityFirst Corporation region.</li> <li>2. Response 2 - You are correct, if the PC identifies a gap, there is no requirement in any standard to address the gap. NERC's ability to require the building or acquisition of new generating capacity, is prohibited by section 215(a)(3) of the FPA and thus no corresponding requirement is proposed. Furthermore, the addition of the new</li> </ol>

	<p>requirement R3 was a result of a Directive noted in FERC Order No 747.</p> <p>3. Response 3 - You are correct, if the PC identifies a gap, there is no requirement in any standard to address the gap. NERC's ability to require the building or acquisition of new generating capacity, is prohibited by section 215(a)(3) of the FPA and thus no corresponding requirement is proposed. Furthermore, the addition of the new requirement R3 was a result of a Directive noted in FERC Order No 747.</p> <p>4. Response 4 - Thank you for your comment.</p> <p>The BAL-502-RF-03 standards does not require the Planning Coordinator to "fill the planning reserve requirement", rather it establishes common criteria, based on "one day in ten year" loss of Load expectation principles, for the analysis, assessment and documentation of Resource Adequacy for Load in the ReliabilityFirst Corporation region.</p> <p>NERC's ability to require the building or acquisition of new generating capacity, is prohibited by section 215(a)(3) of the FPA and thus no corresponding requirement is proposed.</p>
--	--